

Program or Area(s) of Study under Review:

## PHOTOGRAPHY

### Summary of Program Review:

#### A. Major Findings

##### 1. Strengths:

Since the 1970s, the Photography program has been a locus for teaching and training photography professionals, a hub for community enthusiasts, and an important facet of students' general education. The program is located within the larger division of Visual Arts, with facilities that allow for both traditional and digital course offerings. Facilities also include a well-lit gallery space for the exhibition and study of student and/or faculty work. The Photography program benefits from donors' generosity, particularly in the sponsorship of the Photo-Eye speaker series, which will resume a program in the 2023-2024 academic year.

The Photography program has an outstanding part-time faculty who committed to providing rigorous and innovative instruction that is inclusive of a diverse student body.

Historically, photography has been a powerful, democratizing force in society. The equity data for PHOT bears this out. We live a society permeated and shaped by photography and the PHOT program at Napa Valley College hones students' photography skills, analytical ability, and critical thinking in ways that are more relevant than ever.

##### 2. Areas for Improvement:

The photography program at Napa Valley College is at a critical juncture in its history. The decision to not replace retiring faculty John Dotta in Spring 2021 with a permanent full-time successor, and the ensuing impact of Covid-19 pandemic, has left the program in a perilous state.

##### 3. Projected Program Growth, Stability, or Viability:

The program is at Viability. Without the vision and expertise of a full-time faculty member, the program is shrinking rapidly. A program that as recently as 2019-2020 academic year had robust enrollments, a wide variety of course offerings, and good retention and successful completion rates is now in need of an outreach plan, an overhaul of curriculum, and a reframing of the program's degree/certificate offerings. Where other programs in Visual Arts have managed to regain lost enrollments over the pandemic, PHOT still struggles on this account.

#### B. Program's Support of Institutional Mission and Goals

##### 1. Description of Alignment between Program and Institutional Mission:

The Photography program embodies the very idea of students' roles in a "diverse, dynamic, and interdependent world." As creators of photographs—traditional and digital—and consumers of photographs in media and the marketplace, NVC Photography students develop a level of critical analysis and aesthetic appreciation to this pervasive and influential medium.

##### 2. Assessment of Program's Recent Contributions to Institutional Mission:

Additional certificates of achievement enable students to follow specific paths to suit their educational needs, whether for personal enjoyment or professional needs. Ongoing assessment provides data to inform decisions regarding equipment and student success rates. Professional learning sponsored by CEETL has enabled faculty participants to improve online instruction and equity-based teaching practices.

3. Recent Program Activities Promoting the Goals of the Institutional Strategic Plan and Other Institutional Plans/Initiatives:

ISP #1

- Spring 2023 Photography program along with Studio Arts, Digital Art, and Art History hosted local High School students, exhibited student work, and answered questions regarding our programs.

ISP #2

- Despite the challenges of no full-time PHOT faculty, the program has continued to serve student needs by offering classes online and with plans to expand offerings on campus in the coming semesters.
- To support students in their educational path, Photography participated with other Visual Arts programs in an outreach event for Exploration Pathways initiative in November 2022.

ISP #3

- Update and improvement to computer lab spaces to enhance pedagogy
- Refresh camera supply for student use

ISP #4

- Course content and pedagogy engage directly with photography's history and practice as informed by politics, gender, and race.

ISP#6

- As part of the community event to welcome Dr Tarence Powell, Photography was one of the programs highlighted in the community Open House.

C. New Objectives/Goals:

- Hire a full-time Photography faculty member
- Revise PHOT 120 to be IGETC transferable
- Rethink viability of Darkroom classes
- Streamline degrees and certificates
- Revise learning outcomes that are less cumbersome and consistent across certificates/AS degree
- Restart the Photo Eye speaker series as a means of engaging with the community.

D. Description of Process Used to Ensure "Inclusive Program Review"

This report was shared with part-time faculty in Photography, as well as IA Kelly Dunn whose responsibilities include darkroom and computer lab spaces and camera check-out for students enrolled in PHOT courses.

This report covers the following program, degrees, certificates, area(s) of study, and courses (based on the Taxonomy of Programs on file with the Office of Academic Affairs):

| Program                  | Photography                                                                                           |
|--------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Degree(s)/Certificate(s) | Photography: AS<br>Analog Photography: CoA<br>Commercial Photography: CoA<br>Digital Photography: CoA |
| Courses                  | PHOT 110*                                                                                             |
|                          | PHOT 120                                                                                              |
|                          | PHOT 121                                                                                              |
|                          | PHOT 122                                                                                              |
|                          | PHOT 123                                                                                              |
|                          | PHOT 150                                                                                              |
|                          | PHOT 151                                                                                              |
|                          | PHOT 152                                                                                              |
|                          | PHOT 170                                                                                              |
|                          | PHOT 172                                                                                              |
|                          | PHOT 180/ARTH 180                                                                                     |
|                          | PHOT 181                                                                                              |
|                          | PHOT 182                                                                                              |
|                          | PHOT 200*                                                                                             |
|                          | PHOT 210*                                                                                             |
|                          | PHOT 220                                                                                              |
|                          | PHOT 230*                                                                                             |
|                          | PHOT 261                                                                                              |

Taxonomy of Programs, July 2022

## I. PROGRAM DATA

### A. Demand

#### 1. Headcount and Enrollment

|                                                           | 2019-2020     | 2020-2021     | 2021-2022     | Change over<br>3-Year Period |
|-----------------------------------------------------------|---------------|---------------|---------------|------------------------------|
| <b>Headcount</b>                                          |               |               |               |                              |
| <b>Within the Program</b>                                 | <b>443</b>    | <b>320</b>    | <b>239</b>    | <b>-46.0%</b>                |
| <b>Across the Institution</b>                             | <b>8,285</b>  | <b>7,193</b>  | <b>6,646</b>  | <b>-19.8%</b>                |
| <b>Enrollments</b>                                        |               |               |               |                              |
| PHOT-110                                                  | 46            | 44            | 42            | -8.7%                        |
| PHOT-120                                                  | 161           | 133           | 101           | -37.3%                       |
| PHOT-121                                                  | 14            | --            | 5             | -64.3%                       |
| PHOT-122                                                  | 5             | --            | 1             | -80.0%                       |
| PHOT-123                                                  | 6             | --            | 1             | -83.3%                       |
| PHOT-150                                                  | 20            | 28            | 29            | 45.0%                        |
| PHOT-151                                                  | 8             | 5             | 6             | -25.0%                       |
| PHOT-152                                                  | 2             | 4             | 6             | 200%                         |
| PHOT-153B                                                 | 10            | --            | --            | -100%                        |
| PHOT-172                                                  | 14            | --            | --            | -100%                        |
| PHOT-180/ARTH-180                                         | 30            | 35            | 31            | 3.3%                         |
| PHOT-181                                                  | 75            | 40            | 38            | -49.3%                       |
| PHOT-182                                                  | 122           | 81            | 23            | -81.1%                       |
| PHOT-200                                                  | --            | 7             | --            | --                           |
| <b>Within the Program</b>                                 | <b>513</b>    | <b>377</b>    | <b>283</b>    | <b>-44.8%</b>                |
| <b>Across the Institution</b>                             | <b>33,414</b> | <b>30,381</b> | <b>25,203</b> | <b>-24.6%</b>                |
| <i>Source: SQL Queries for Spring 2023 Program Review</i> |               |               |               |                              |

***RPIE Analysis:** The number of students enrolled (headcount) in the Photography Program decreased by 46.0% over the past three years, while headcount across the institution decreased by 19.8%. Enrollment within the Photography Program decreased by 44.8%, while enrollment across the institution decreased by 24.6%.*

*Enrollment in the following courses changed by more than 10% ( $\pm 10\%$ ) between 2019-2020 and 2021-2022:*

*Courses with enrollment increases:*

- PHOT-152 (200%)
- PHOT-150 (45.0%)

*Courses with enrollment decreases:*

- PHOT-153B (-100%)
- PHOT-172 (-100%)
- PHOT-123 (-83.3%)
- PHOT-182 (-81.1%)

- PHOT-122 (-80.0%)
- PHOT-121 (-64.3%)
- PHOT-181 (-49.3%)
- PHOT-120 (-37.3%)
- PHOT-151 (-25.0%)

*\*Note: While enrollments among concurrent classes are reported separately (at the course level) in Section I.A.1, concurrent courses are reported as one (joint) observation in Section I.A.2.*

### Program Reflection:

In 2019-2020 headcount reached its peak (since before 2016-2017) at 443, but suffered a precipitous drop (higher than that of the college) likely due to shifts in course offerings during the pandemic. Prior to pandemic all PHOT courses were offered in person, with the exception of 1-2 sections of PHOT 120, PHOT 181 and PHOT 182. After Spring 2020, PHOT 150/151/152 (Digital Photography) were added online, but clearly Darkroom courses, Lighting courses, Lifestyle Photography, Night Photography courses would not be feasibly offered in a virtual environment.

A more limited offering of classes online along with fewer sections of PHOT 120, PHOT 181, PHOT 182 online would explain overall decreases in enrollment.

Finally, fewer enrollments in the online PHOT courses could be linked to the constraints of proper equipment, stable WiFi, distraction-free learning environment.

Vital to this program is the hiring of a full-time faculty member who can coordinate outreach and marketing to local high schools, non-traditional students, and other populations to grow enrollments. Moving forward, it is important to build momentum so that cohorts of students begin in PHOT 120 and 150 in person, develop relationships with faculty and peers, and move through a sequence of courses so that there are sufficient numbers to support offering PHOT 200, 210 Lighting or PHOT 172 Night Photography. Beginning in Fall 2023 PHOT 120 will be offered in person as a means of building this momentum.

## 2. Average Class Size

|                               | 2019-2020    |              | 2020-2021    |              | 2021-2022    |              | Three-Year           |              |
|-------------------------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|----------------------|--------------|
|                               | Sections     | Average Size | Sections     | Average Size | Sections     | Average Size | Average Section Size | Trend        |
| PHOT-110                      | 2            | 23.0         | 2            | 22.0         | 2            | 21.0         | 22.0                 | -8.7%        |
| PHOT-120                      | 9            | 17.9         | 6            | 22.2         | 5            | 20.2         | 19.8                 | 12.8%        |
| PHOT-121                      | 2            | 12.5         | --           | --           | 1            | 7.0          | 10.7                 | -44.0%       |
| PHOT-150                      | 2            | 15.0         | 2            | 18.5         | 2            | 20.5         | 18.0                 | 36.7%        |
| PHOT-153B                     | 1            | 10.0         | --           | --           | --           | --           | 10.0                 | -100%        |
| PHOT-172                      | 1            | 14.0         | --           | --           | --           | --           | 14.0                 | -100%        |
| PHOT-180                      | 1            | 30.0         | 1            | 35.0         | 1            | 31.0         | 32.0                 | 3.3%         |
| PHOT-181                      | 3            | 25.0         | 2            | 20.0         | 2            | 19.0         | 21.9                 | -24.0%       |
| PHOT-182                      | 5            | 24.4         | 4            | 20.3         | 1            | 23.0         | 22.6                 | -5.7%        |
| PHOT-200                      | --           | --           | 1            | 7.0          | --           | --           | 7.0                  | --           |
| <b>Program Average*</b>       | <b>26</b>    | <b>19.7</b>  | <b>18</b>    | <b>20.9</b>  | <b>14</b>    | <b>20.2</b>  | <b>19.9</b>          | <b>2.5%</b>  |
| <b>Institutional Average*</b> | <b>1,332</b> | <b>25.1</b>  | <b>1,202</b> | <b>25.3</b>  | <b>1,111</b> | <b>22.7</b>  | <b>24.4</b>          | <b>-9.6%</b> |

Source: SQL Queries for Spring 2023 Program Review

Average Section Size across the three-year period for courses, and both within academic years and across the three-year period for the program and institutional levels is calculated as:

$$\frac{\text{Total \# Enrollments}}{\text{Total \# Sections}}$$

It is not the average of the three annual averages.

Concurrent sections for PHOT 121, 122, and 123 are reported under PHOT-121.

Concurrent sections for PHOT 150, 151, and 152 are reported under PHOT-150.

Concurrent sections for PHOT-180 and ARTH-180 are reported under PHOT-180.

***RPIE Analysis:** Over the past three years, the Photography Program has claimed an average of 19.9 students per section. The average class size in the program has been lower than the average class size of 24.4 students per section across the institution during this period. Average class size in the program increased by 2.5% between 2019-2020 and 2021-2022. Average class size at the institutional level decreased by 9.6% over the same period.*

*Average class size in the following courses changed by more than 10% ( $\pm 10\%$ ) between 2019-2020 and 2021-2022:*

*Courses with increases in average class size:*

- PHOT-120 (12.8%)
- PHOT-150 (36.7%)

*Courses with decreases in average class size:*

- PHOT-153B (-100%)
- PHOT-172 (-100%)
- PHOT-121 (-44.0%)
- PHOT-181 (-24.0%)

### Program Reflection:

Those PHOT courses with marked decreases in class size would include: PHOT 153 B Adobe Lightroom which has been archived; PHOT 121 Darkroom, which has seen a reduction in class size dating back to before 2019; PHOT 172 Night Photography which hasn't been offered since 2019-2020.

PHOT 181 saw smaller class sizes during the height of the pandemic, but as of S23 headcount is up from 17 to 23.

Again, a full-time faculty member could assess how to build back the program and return courses to previously robust numbers. A discipline expert could build schedules that would serve all students, and revise curriculum and programs to attract new students.

### 3. Fill Rate and Productivity

| Fill Rate                |             |          |              |
|--------------------------|-------------|----------|--------------|
|                          | Enrollments | Capacity | Fill Rate    |
| 2019-2020                | 513         | 578      | 88.8%        |
| 2020-2021                | 377         | 442      | 85.3%        |
| 2021-2022                | 283         | 337      | 84.0%        |
| Three-Year Program Total | 1,173       | 1,357    | 86.4%        |
| Productivity             |             |          |              |
|                          | FTES        | FTEF     | Productivity |

|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |              |             |            |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------|-------------|------------|
| <b>2019-2020</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | 55.5         | 6.0         | 9.3        |
| <b>2020-2021</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | 38.7         | 4.0         | 9.7        |
| <b>2021-2022</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | 27.8         | 3.2         | 8.7        |
| <b>Three-Year Program Total</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | <b>122.0</b> | <b>13.2</b> | <b>9.2</b> |
| <i>Sources: SQL Queries for Spring 2023 Program Review; SQL Server Reporting Services – Term to Term Enrollment FTES Load Comparison Report (by Credit Course)</i><br><i>Note: For the fill rate calculations above, the “global capacity” for concurrent courses was used.</i> |              |             |            |

***RPIE Analysis:** The fill rate within the Photography Program ranged from 84.0% to 88.8% over the past three years, and the fill rate across the three-year period was 86.4%. [Fill rate has not been calculated at the institutional level.] Between 2019-2020 and 2020-2021, both enrollment and capacity decreased, resulting in a decrease in fill rate (due to a higher rate of decrease in enrollment). Between 2020-2021 and 2021-2022, both enrollment and capacity decreased, resulting in a decrease in fill rate (due to a higher rate of decrease in enrollment).*

*Productivity within the Photography Program ranged from 8.7 to 9.7 over the past three years, totaling 9.2 across the three-year period. [Productivity has not been calculated at the institutional level.] The three-year program productivity of 9.2 is lower than the target level of 17.5, which reflects 1 FTEF (full-time equivalent faculty) accounting for 17.5 FTES (full-time equivalent students) across the academic year. (This target reflects 525 weekly student contact hours for one full-time student across the academic year.)*

#### **Program Reflection:**

Fill-rates and productivity have remained consistent since before the pandemic, when most courses were offered face-to-face and gateway courses were offered in multiple sections. With the reduction of courses the fill rate has remained strong. Again, PHOT enjoyed strong fill-rate and productivity figures in the last program review; while scheduling during the pandemic is certainly a factor here, so too is the lack of a full-time discipline expert who could build back the PHOT program.

#### **4. Labor Market Demand**

| Economic Development<br>Department Standard<br>Occupational Classification<br>Description Code <b>27-4021</b><br><b>Photographers</b> | Numeric Change<br>in Employment<br>(Baseline Year<br>to Projected<br>Year) | Projected Growth<br>(% Change in<br>Positions; 2018 Base<br>Employment vs. 2028<br>Projected<br>Employment) | Projected<br>Number of<br>Positions (Total<br>Job Openings) |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------|
| Napa County (2-018-2028)                                                                                                              | -20                                                                        | -33.3%                                                                                                      | 30                                                          |
| Bay Area <sup>A</sup> (2018-2028)                                                                                                     | -210                                                                       | -7.5%                                                                                                       | 2,440                                                       |
| California (2018-2028)                                                                                                                | 3,800                                                                      | 27.1%                                                                                                       | 18,080                                                      |

Source: Economic Development Department Labor Market Information, Occupational Data, Occupational Projections (<http://www.labormarketinfo.edd.ca.gov>)

<sup>A</sup>Bay Area counties include: Alameda, Contra Costa, Marin, San Francisco, San Mateo, Santa Clara, Solano, and Sonoma. Figures also include San Benito County (reported with projections for Santa Clara County).

**RPIE Analysis:** The figures reported in the table above pertain to the Standard Occupational Classification for the following position:

- Photographers

The Economic Development Department projects a decrease of 20 positions within Napa County and a decrease of 210 positions within the Bay Area for the Photography Program by 2028 (compared to 2018). These decreases in the number of positions translate to a 33.3% decrease for the industry within Napa County and a 7.5% decrease within the Bay Area (not including Napa County). While decreases are projected for Napa County and the Bay Area, the number of positions across California is expected to increase by 27.1% by 2028.

### Program Reflection:

The continued dwindling labor demand for Photography would suggest a shift away from commercial photography to Photography as GE and transfer. As of the last review cycle, a Commercial Photography Certificate of Achievement and Digital Photography Certificate of Achievement had been developed; dwindling enrollments make successful completion of these certificates more unlikely for our students. Transfer and General Ed might make more sense currently.

## B. Momentum

### 1. Retention and Successful Course Completion Rates

| Level     | Retention Rates<br>(Across Three Years)      |                                 |       | Successful Course Completion<br>Rates<br>(Across Three Years) |                                 |       |
|-----------|----------------------------------------------|---------------------------------|-------|---------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------|-------|
|           | Rate                                         | Course Rate vs.<br>Program Rate |       | Rate                                                          | Course Rate vs.<br>Program Rate |       |
|           |                                              | Above                           | Below |                                                               | Above                           | Below |
| PHOT-110  | 78.9%                                        |                                 | X     | 60.9%                                                         |                                 | X     |
| PHOT-120  | 82.5%                                        |                                 | X     | 68.3%                                                         |                                 | X     |
| PHOT-121  | 100%                                         | X                               |       | 100%                                                          | X                               |       |
| PHOT-122  | Data suppressed due to low N (<10 students). |                                 |       |                                                               |                                 |       |
| PHOT-123  | Data suppressed due to low N (<10 students). |                                 |       |                                                               |                                 |       |
| PHOT-150  | 89.0%                                        | X                               |       | 83.6%                                                         | X                               |       |
| PHOT-151  | 94.4%                                        | X                               |       | 83.3%                                                         | X                               |       |
| PHOT-152  | 72.7%                                        |                                 | X     | 63.6%                                                         |                                 | X     |
| PHOT-153B | 80.0%                                        |                                 | X     | 50.0%                                                         |                                 | X     |
| PHOT-172  | 100%                                         | X                               |       | 92.3%                                                         | X                               |       |
| PHOT-180  | 86.5%                                        | --                              | --    | 74.0%                                                         | --                              | --    |

|                     |                                              |          |  |       |          |  |
|---------------------|----------------------------------------------|----------|--|-------|----------|--|
| PHOT-181            | 89.9%                                        | X        |  | 77.2% | X        |  |
| PHOT-182            | 93.8%                                        | <b>X</b> |  | 81.0% | <b>X</b> |  |
| PHOT-200            | Data suppressed due to low N (<10 students). |          |  |       |          |  |
| Program Level       | 86.7%                                        |          |  | 73.5% |          |  |
| Institutional Level | 89.6%                                        |          |  | 74.0% |          |  |

*Source: SQL Queries for Spring 2023 Program Review*

-- Indicates a value that is within 1% of the program-level rate.

***Bold italics*** denote a statistically significant difference between the course-level rate and the program-level rate.

**Bold** denotes a statistically significant difference between the program-level rate and the institutional rate.

**Note:** Grades of EW (Excused Withdrawal) for spring 2020 and beyond are not included in the calculations of the three-year retention and successful course completion rates reported above. This approach reflects the standard recommended research practice of not including EWs in either the numerator or the denominator for these rates.

***RPIE Analysis:*** Over the past three years, the retention rate for the Photography Program was significantly lower than the rate at the institutional level. The retention rates for PHOT-110, PHOT-120, and PHOT-152 were significantly lower than the program-level rate. The retention rate for PHOT-182 was significantly higher than the program-level rate. The retention rate for the Photography Program falls within the first quartile (Q1) among program-level retention rates (across 58 instructional programs, over the past three years). The retention rate for Photography is among the lowest 25% of retention rates among NVC programs.

Over the past three years, the successful course completion rate for the Photography Program reflected the rate at the institutional level. The successful course completion rates for PHOT-110 and PHOT-120 were significantly lower than the program-level rate. The successful course completion rates for PHOT-121, PHOT-150, and PHOT-182 were significantly higher than the program-level rate. The successful course completion rate for the Photography Program falls within the second quartile (Q2) among program-level successful course completion rates (across 58 instructional programs, over the past three years). The successful course completion rate for Photography falls within the 25%-50% range of successful course completion rates among NVC programs.

Over the past three years, the difference between retention and successful course completion at the program level (13.2%) was significantly lower than the difference at the institutional level (15.6%). This figure represents the proportion of non-passing grades assigned to students (i.e., grades of D, F, I, NP).

The following Photography courses claimed a difference (between retention and successful course completion) that exceeded 10%:

- PHOT-123 (33.3%)
- PHOT-153B (30.0%)
- PHOT-110 (18.0%)
- PHOT-200 (14.3%)
- PHOT-120 (14.2%)
- PHOT-182 (12.8%)
- PHOT-181 (12.7%)

- PHOT-180 (12.5%)
- PHOT-151 (11.1%)

## Program Reflection:

Having studied retention and successful completion rates disaggregated by semester, it is clear that those significant differences in the PHOT 110 Smartphone Photography and PHOT 120 Foundations of Photography might be down to the challenges presented by online learning early in the pandemic. Since Fall 2021 PHOT 120 has been steadily improving in both retention and successful completion. Success rates of PHOT 110 have been below institutional levels, with the exception of Spring 2022. This may require some reflection regarding the curriculum, the role of the course in the larger program.

Interestingly, the same shift to online in PHOT 150/151 Digital Photography didn't show a similar dip in rates, although PHOT 152 did (likely the increased rigor of an advanced level course).

PHOT 181 Contemporary Issues in Photography and PHOT 182 Photography in a Multicultural US continue to perform better than the institutional average, which indicate the appeal and relevance of the content to students seeking General Ed as well as those pursuing photography.

Improvement to both Retention and Successful Completion rates requires a full-time discipline expert who can collaborate with part-time faculty to develop strategies for retention/success. Currently there is no opportunity for faculty experts to meet, share teaching ideas, and address some of the challenges facing students both in online and face-to-face courses.

## 2. Student Equity

|                        | Retention Rates<br>(Across Three Years) |                   | Successful Course Completion Rates<br>(Across Three Years) |                   |
|------------------------|-----------------------------------------|-------------------|------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|
|                        | Program Level                           | Institution Level | Program Level                                              | Institution Level |
| African American/Black | 79.1%                                   | 86.4%             | 67.4%                                                      | 65.6%             |
| Latinx/Hispanic        |                                         | 88.7%             | 71.0%                                                      | 70.3%             |
| First Generation       |                                         | 89.2%             | 75.9%                                                      | 72.7%             |
| Veteran                |                                         | 91.1%             | 75.0%                                                      | 71.9%             |
| 19 or Younger          |                                         | 89.8%             | 69.7%                                                      | 72.3%             |

Source: SQL Queries for Spring 2023 Program Review

**Bold italics** denote a statistically significant difference between rates at the program and institutional levels, with the lower of the two rates in **bold italics**.

Shaded cells pertaining to retention rates indicate that statistically significant differences for those groups were not found at the institutional level.

**Note:** Grades of EW (Excused Withdrawal) for spring 2020 and beyond are not included in the calculations of the three-year retention and successful course completion rates reported above. This approach reflects the standard recommended research practice of not including EWs in either the numerator or the denominator for these rates.

**RPIE Analysis:** This analysis of student equity focuses on the five demographic groups with significantly lower retention and/or successful course completion rates found at the institutional level (vs. the corresponding rates among all other demographic groups, combined) over the past three years. Tests of statistical significance were conducted to compare program-level and institution-level rates among the five groups listed above.

Within the Photography Program, the retention rate among African American/Black students was lower than the rate at the institutional level. (The difference was not statistically significant.)

*Within the Photography Program, the successful course completion rates among African Americans/Blacks, Latinx/Hispanics, first-generation students, and veterans exceeded the corresponding rates at the institutional level. The successful course completion rate among students 19 and younger was lower at the program level than the institutional level. (All of these differences were not statistically significant.)*

*These findings regarding retention and successful course completion among equity groups are consistent with the findings that emerged from the comparison of retention and successful course completion at the program vs. institutional level, where the program-level rate was lower than the institution-level rate for retention (although the difference was statistically significant) and the program-level rate mirrored the institution-level rate for successful course completion. (See Section I.B.1 above.)*

### Program Reflection:

Since the last program review, the successful completion rate has improved for Black/African American students has risen over 25%. This jump might have to do with initiatives outlined in the last review that expanded content in courses to include the work of photographers from diverse backgrounds, as well as equity-informed pedagogy.

### 3. Retention and Successful Course Completion Rates by Delivery Mode (of Courses Taught through Multiple Delivery Modes, i.e., In-Person, Hybrid, and Online)

|                      | Retention Rates<br>(Across Three Years) |        |        | Successful Course Completion Rates<br>(Across Three Years) |        |        |
|----------------------|-----------------------------------------|--------|--------|------------------------------------------------------------|--------|--------|
|                      | In-Person                               | Hybrid | Online | In-Person                                                  | Hybrid | Online |
| PHOT-120             |                                         |        |        |                                                            |        |        |
| In-person vs. Online | 87.0%                                   |        | 88.2%  | 69.6%                                                      |        | 52.9%  |

*Source: SQL Queries for Spring 2023 Program Review*

This table compares student performance in courses offered through multiple delivery modes within the same academic year.

*Bold italics* denote a significantly lower rate within that delivery mode.

Note: The analysis of retention and successful course completion by delivery mode does not include spring 2020 – spring 2021 because most courses shifted to an online/hybrid delivery mode beginning in spring 2020 due to the COVID-19 pandemic (thereby blurring the distinction between delivery modes).

RPIE Analysis: Over the past three years, one course within the Photography Program has been offered through at least two delivery modes within the same academic year. In 2019-2020, PHOT-120 was offered through in-person and online formats. This analysis focuses on program-level rates. Since PHOT-120 was the only course to be offered through multiple delivery modes, the program-level rates mirror the rates in PHOT-120.

*Within the Photography Program:*

- *The retention rate in in-person sections was lower than the retention rate in online sections. (The difference was not statistically significant.)*
- *The successful course completion rate within online sections was lower than the successful course completion rate in in-person sections. (The difference was not statistically significant.)*

## Program Reflection:

Before the pandemic, Photography was already scheduling online PHOT 120 courses to build enrollments and introduce students to the basics of the discipline. Moving forward, the Photography program could return to offering both online and in-person sections, but the current trends in student enrollment (not necessarily successful completion) favor online instruction.

Courses such as Lighting are likely more effective in a face-to-face modality; unfortunately, without a critical number of enrollments it is difficult to schedule such courses.

## C. Student Achievement

### 1. Program Completion

|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | 2019-2020  | 2020-2021  | 2021-2022  |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|------------|------------|
| <b>Degrees</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |            |            |            |
| Photography AS                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | 1          | 2          | 1          |
| <b>Institutional: AS Degrees</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | <b>422</b> | <b>394</b> | <b>305</b> |
| <b>Average Time to Degree (in Years)<sup>+</sup></b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |            |            |            |
| Photography AS                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | *          | *          | *          |
| <b>Institutional: AS Degrees</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | <b>4.7</b> | <b>4.9</b> | <b>4.6</b> |
| <i>Source: SQL Queries for Spring 2023 Program Review</i>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |            |            |            |
| *Time to degree/certificate within the program reported among cohorts with at least 10 graduates within the academic year. Asterisk indicates that data have been suppressed.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |            |            |            |
| +Average time to degree/certificate was calculated among students who completed a degree/certificate within 10 years (between first year of enrollment at NVC and award conferral year). Among 2018-2019 completers, the average time to degree/certificate was calculated among students who enrolled at NVC for the first time in 2009-2010 or later. Among 2019-2020 completers, the average time to degree was calculated among students who enrolled at NVC for the first time in 2010-2011 or later. |            |            |            |
| Note: Degrees include Photography and Photography – Digital.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |            |            |            |

*RPIE Analysis: The number of AS degrees conferred by the Photography Program remained stable between 2019-2020 and 2021-2022, with one degree conferred in each of those two years. Over the same period, the number of AS degrees conferred by the institution decreased by 27.7%. The Photography Program accounted for less than 1% of the AS degrees conferred in 2019-2020 and in 2021-2022. For all three years, the average time to degree for the program is not reported due to small cohort sizes.*

## Program Reflection:

With the shift to online learning, the Photography program has not had the ability to build a cohort of students who can then enroll in a sequence of courses. Without that momentum, time to degree is both extended and successful completion of degree/certificates is hampered.

### 2. Program-Set Standards: Job Placement and Licensure Exam Pass Rates

| Measure | Program-Set Standard*<br>(& Stretch Goal) | Recent Performance |        |        |                  |
|---------|-------------------------------------------|--------------------|--------|--------|------------------|
|         |                                           | Year 1             | Year 2 | Year 3 | Three-Year Total |

|                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                    |                                                                                                           |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Job Placement Rate                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | **                                                 | Data suppressed due to small cohort size (< 10 students each year, and < 10 students across three years). |
| Licensure Exam Pass Rate                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | Licensure exams are not required for this program. |                                                                                                           |
| <i>Sources: Perkins IV Core 4 Employment data for Program (TOP Code: 0505) for job placement rates (<a href="https://misweb.cccco.edu/perkins/Core_Indicator_Reports/Summ_CoreIndi_TOPCode.aspx">https://misweb.cccco.edu/perkins/Core_Indicator_Reports/Summ_CoreIndi_TOPCode.aspx</a>)</i><br>**The Photography Program has not defined a program-level standard and stretch goal for job placement. |                                                    |                                                                                                           |

***RPIE Analysis:** Job placement rates for the Photography Program are not reported due to small cohort size. Recent cohorts ranged from 2 to 4 students over the past three years. The Photography Program has not established a program-level standard and stretch goal for the job placement rate. As Applied Photography is a program that is reported in the Perkins IV/Career Technical Education data provided by the California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office, the program should define a standard and goal for this metric.*

### Program Reflection:

This data would indicate that—as stated above—the decreasing number of Photography jobs in the local labor market would have a corresponding impact on any job placement data.

## II. CURRICULUM

### A. Courses

| Subject | Course Number | Date of Last Review<br>(Courses with last review dates of 6 years or more must be scheduled for immediate review) | Has Prerequisite*<br>Yes/No & Data of Last Review | In Need of Revision<br>Indicate Non-Substantive (NS) or Substantive (S) & Academic Year | To Be Archived<br>(as Obsolete, Outdated, or Irrelevant) & Academic Year | No Change |
|---------|---------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|
| PHOT    | 110           | 8/31/ 2021                                                                                                        | No                                                |                                                                                         |                                                                          | x         |
| PHOT    | 120           | 8/12/2022                                                                                                         | No                                                |                                                                                         |                                                                          | x         |
| PHOT    | 121           | 1/16/2018                                                                                                         | No                                                | NS                                                                                      |                                                                          |           |
| PHOT    | 122           | 8/14/2020                                                                                                         | No                                                | NS                                                                                      |                                                                          |           |
| PHOT    | 123           | 8/14/2020                                                                                                         | No                                                | NS                                                                                      |                                                                          |           |
| PHOT    | 150           | 1/16/2018                                                                                                         | No                                                | NS                                                                                      |                                                                          |           |
| PHOT    | 151           | 1/16/2018                                                                                                         | No                                                | NS                                                                                      |                                                                          |           |
| PHOT    | 152           | 1/16/2018                                                                                                         | No                                                | NS                                                                                      |                                                                          |           |
| PHOT    | 170           | 8/11/2014                                                                                                         | No                                                | NS                                                                                      |                                                                          |           |
| PHOT    | 172           | 1/16/2015                                                                                                         | No                                                | NS                                                                                      |                                                                          |           |
| PHOT    | 180           | 8/14/2020                                                                                                         | No                                                |                                                                                         |                                                                          | x         |
| PHOT    | 181           | 8/13/2021                                                                                                         | No                                                |                                                                                         |                                                                          | x         |

|      |     |           |    |    |   |
|------|-----|-----------|----|----|---|
| PHOT | 182 | 8/13/2021 | No |    | X |
| PHOT | 200 | 1/13/2017 | No | NS |   |
| PHOT | 210 | 1/13/2017 | No | NS |   |
| PHOT | 230 | 1/13/2017 | No | NS |   |
| PHOT | 261 | 8/13/2018 | No | NS |   |

\*As of fall 2018, prerequisites need to be validated (in subsequent process) through Curriculum Committee.

#### B. Degrees and Certificates\*

| Degree or Certificate & Title | Implementation Date | Has Documentation<br>Yes/No | In Need of Revision+<br>and/or<br>Missing Documentation<br>& Academic Year | To Be Archived*<br>(as Obsolete,<br>Outdated, or<br>Irrelevant)<br>& Academic Year | No Change |
|-------------------------------|---------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|
| Photography AS                |                     |                             |                                                                            |                                                                                    |           |
| Digital Photography CoA       | 11/29/22            | Yes                         | No                                                                         |                                                                                    | X         |
| Analog Photography CoA        | 11/29/22            | Yes                         | No                                                                         |                                                                                    | X         |
| Commercial Photography CoA    | 11/29/22            | Yes                         | No                                                                         |                                                                                    | X         |

\*As of fall 2018, discontinuance or archival of degrees or certificates must go through the Program Discontinuance or Archival Task Force.

\*Degrees and Certificates cannot be implemented until the required courses in them are approved and active.

#### Program Reflection:

PHOT 120 has formally been denied approval as CSU GE C1. This course no longer being CSU GE transferable will have negative impact on enrollments, unless the course undergoes considerable revision. Ideally the course could undergo revision, including the incorporation of historic context, to meet the standards of the soon-to-be Cal-GETC transfer curriculum.

Degree/Certificates: As stated above, the local labor market data might indicate a shift away from commercial photography and towards transfer/General Ed. But the possible archiving of particular classes and certificates of achievement needs to happen after thoughtful reflection, deep research into what other Photography programs in the area are offering, and realistic projection of success given the current low enrollments. All of this requires the time and attention of a discipline expert.

### III. LEARNING OUTCOMES ASSESSMENT

#### A. Status of Learning Outcomes Assessment

##### Learning Outcomes Assessment at the Course Level

|                   | Number of Courses with Outcomes Assessed |                   | Proportion of Courses with Outcomes Assessed |                   |
|-------------------|------------------------------------------|-------------------|----------------------------------------------|-------------------|
| Number of Courses | Over Last 4 Years                        | Over Last 6 Years | Over Last 4 Years                            | Over Last 6 Years |
| 19                | 14                                       | 17                | 74%                                          | 89%               |

##### Learning Outcomes Assessment at the Program/Degree/Certificate Level

| Degree/Certificate         | Number of Outcomes* | Number of Outcomes Assessed |                   | Proportion of Outcomes Assessed |                   |
|----------------------------|---------------------|-----------------------------|-------------------|---------------------------------|-------------------|
|                            |                     | Over Last 4 Years           | Over Last 6 Years | Over Last 4 Years               | Over Last 6 Years |
| Photography AS             | 5                   | 5                           | 5                 | 100%                            | 100%              |
| Analog Photography CoA     | 3                   | 0                           | 0                 | 0                               | 0                 |
| Commercial Photography CoA | 5                   | 3                           | 3                 | 60%                             | 60%               |
| Digital Photography CoA    | 5                   | 4                           | 4                 | 80%                             | 80%               |

#### Program Reflection:

The analog Photograph CoA acquired certificate level learning outcomes as of S23. These are tied to the outcomes of the Photograph AS. The recommendation moving forward is to clarify and streamline the language of both the degree and certificates so there is consistency throughout. Under John Dotta, assessment was conducted-- every class, every semester-- using SALG (or Student Assessment of Learning Gains) in the interest of ascertaining quickly the impact of any changes implemented. Such rigorous and consistent assessment is valuable, but only possible with a full-time faculty coordinator in Photography, which we currently do not have.

#### B. Summary of Learning Outcomes Assessment Findings and Actions

While much of the assessment findings relate to the SALG and assessment of the instrument, the data since 2020 looks at implementing change (PHOT 150) that support students in photographic archive research related to personal histories. These kinds of assignments reinforce the importance of personal stories as key to retention and success and places equity at the center of teaching and learning. While the SALG data is extensive it is challenging for a subsequent faculty member to decipher the conclusions of the data as it states mostly percentage changes without equally extensive discourse on possible shifts in pedagogy/content.

#### Program Reflection:

With thoughtful reflection and collaboration, there could be important refining and revising of both course level and program-level outcomes that provide a clearer vision of what students gain from the PHOT program.

There are certainly opportunities to combine specific outcomes to facilitate assessment and remove language that ties too closely to either commercial or academic review of portfolios.

#### IV. PROGRAM PLAN

Based on the information included in this document, the program is described as being in a state of:

- ☒ Viability
- ☐ Stability
- ☐ Growth

\*Please select ONE of the above.

**This evaluation of the state of the program is supported by the following parts of this report:**

- Lack of a FT Photography faculty to oversee and guide program/collaborate with adjunct faculty/update curriculum/do outreach (I A.1-3, I.B.1, II.A, B, III.A)
- Rethink career-oriented Certificates of Achievement/Courses when labor data suggests a decrease in demand (I.A.4, I.C.2)
- Revision and possible archiving of courses/certificates (II.A,B)
- Streamlining of Learning Outcomes to facilitate assessment (III.A, B)

Complete the table below to outline a three-year plan for the program, within the context of the current state of the program.

## PROGRAM: PHOTOGRAPHY

Plan Years: 2023-2024 through 2025-2026

| Strategic Initiatives<br>Emerging from Program<br>Review                                   | Relevant<br>Section(s) of<br>Report | Implementation<br>Timeline:<br>Activity/Activities &<br>Date(s)                                                 | Measure(s) of Progress or<br>Effectiveness                                                |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Move Photography Program from Viability to Stability                                       | I.A.1-3, I.B.1, II.A<br>II.B, III.A | Hire a FT faculty as soon as financially feasible; in the meanwhile hire a PT faculty to assist with curriculum | Increased enrollments /headcount<br><br>Improved Retention/Student Success Rates          |
| Review and update curriculum for transferability                                           | II.A                                | Revise PHOT 120 Fall 2023 by discipline expert                                                                  | Cal-GETC approval for PHOT 120                                                            |
| Review and update curriculum to ensure alignment between degree offerings and student need | I.A.4, I.C.2, II.B                  | Begin in Fall 2023 by discipline expert                                                                         | Higher rates of successful course/degree completion                                       |
| Condense and clarify learning outcomes to improve data gathering and faculty conversation  | III.A, III.B                        | Begin in Fall 2023--ongoing                                                                                     | Better opportunity for more conversation/collaboration among PHOT faculty                 |
| Target HS students, recent HS grads as possible PHOT students                              | I.A.1-3                             | Begin Fall 2023-enlist previously produced video as well as website design to attract high school students      | Increased enrollments; adjust course offerings for that population (schedule in evenings) |
| Build community among PHOT students and host community photography enthusiasts             | I.A.1-3                             | Restart the Photo Eye speaker series Fall 2023 with speakers Spring 2024                                        | Host 1-2 speakers on campus                                                               |

Describe the current state of program resources relative to the plan outlined above. (Resources include: personnel, technology, equipment, facilities, operating budget, training, and library/learning materials.) Identify any anticipated resource needs (beyond the current levels) necessary to implement the plan outlined above.

Note: Resources to support program plans are allocated through the annual planning and budget process (not the program review process). The information included in this report will be used as a starting point, to inform the development of plans and resource requests submitted by the program over the next three years.

**Description of Current Program Resources Relative to Plan:**

The Photography program has more than adequate facilities; there is good exhibition space, lighting studios, darkroom, and as of Fall 2023 two Mac Labs outfitted with brand new iMacs. There are engaged part-time faculty whose expertise could shape and refine PHOT curriculum until the hiring of a full-time faculty in the area.

## **V. PROGRAM HIGHLIGHTS**

The program-level plan that emerged from the last review (Spring 2020) included the following initiatives:

- Increase number of camera and related equipment for student checkout.
- Outreach to feeder schools

### **A. Accomplishments/Achievements Associated with Most Recent Three-Year Program-Level Plan**

With much of Photography being offered online in the last few years, the need for increasing the number of cameras was not pressing. That said, through the annual planning process and DAS funds linked to photography, we have managed to refresh existing cameras in advance of PHOT 120 being offered in person Fall 23.

Outreach was also curtailed due to lockdown, but slowly the college is renewing outreach efforts. In Fall 2022, student work from past semesters was on display at the beginning of the semester for students returning to classes in the 3700 building. The Photography program was part of a Pathways Pizza Party in November 2022 to encourage PHOT enrollments among those interested in the Visual, Design & Performing Arts Exploration path. This Spring Visual Arts has hosted groups of local High School students with the exhibition of work in the College Gallery, including that of Photography students.

### **B. Recent Improvements**

An effort at rebuilding momentum in the Photography program is starting in Fall 2023 with the offering of PHOT 120, the gateway course, in person. It is hoped that providing students opportunity for engagement with the faculty, the facilities, and with one another, we can cultivate a cohort of students moving forward. The refresh of Mac computers in both 3705 and 3950 will enable us to schedule more PHOT courses on campus.

### **C. Effective Practices**

The Photography program's greatest asset is its part-time faculty and staff. IA Kelly Dunn provides much needed student support in the computer labs and the management of cameras and related equipment. The part-time faculty are dedicated professionals who bring an engagement and rigor to the program. What is needed now is a full-time faculty who can bring a vision and energy to the program.

PHOTOGRAPHY SPRING 2023

Completed by Supervising Administrator:

Robert Van Der Velde, Senior Dean

Date:

4/28/23

Strengths and successes of the program, as evidenced by analysis of data, outcomes assessment, and curriculum:

Historically Photography has been a strong program with good enrollments. The perfect storm of plummeting enrollments due to disproportionate impacts from COVID plus the loss of a full-time faculty member have left the program in a perilous state.

Areas of concern, if any:

Labor market data indicate declining job opportunities in Photography, which would suggest that Photography should not be a Career & Technical Education program, and should change the focus to be general education and transfer. Certificates of Achievement have not been popular among students. Serious consideration should also be given to discontinuing the darkroom, as it is expensive to maintain and has been largely replaced by digital photography.

Recommendations for improvement:

The college needs to decide whether to maintain a Photography program, which requires a tenure-track fulltime faculty member for the program to have a viable future. Even with a tenure-track hire, the focus should shift from Career & Technical Education, and the darkroom should be discontinued.

Anticipated Resource Needs:

| Resource Type                      | Description of Need (Initial, Including Justification and Direct Linkage to State of the Program) |
|------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Personnel: Faculty                 | Photography needs a full-time faculty member to be considered a viable program.                   |
| Personnel: Classified              |                                                                                                   |
| Personnel: Admin/Confidential      |                                                                                                   |
| Instructional Equipment            |                                                                                                   |
| Instructional Technology           |                                                                                                   |
| Facilities                         |                                                                                                   |
| Operating Budget                   |                                                                                                   |
| Professional Development/ Training |                                                                                                   |
| Library & Learning Materials       |                                                                                                   |