

Administration of Justice

Summary of Program Review:

A. Major Findings

1. Strengths:

- Access to highly educated and experienced faculty to deliver instruction in the program.
- Strong demand by the workforce for the program.
- Strong relationship with the local workforce through an active advisory committee and support for student internships.
- High level of student success in job placement.
- Broad array of stackable certificate options creating a strong pathway to a degree, transfer, and directly into the workforce.

2. Areas for Improvement:

- Increase enrollment to at least pre-pandemic levels.
- Increase access for employers, recruiters, and students to job opportunities.
- Increase access for high schools to CCAP classes offered by the department.

3. Projected Program Growth, Stability, or Viability:

- Growth through increased enrollment on campus in this post COVID period.
- Growth through increased enrollment in CCAP classes offered at area high schools.
- Growth through increased interest in the new Law Enforcement Career Preparation Certificate and Crime Scene Investigations Certificate programs.

B. Program's Support of Institutional Mission and Goals

1. Description of Alignment between Program and Institutional Mission:

The Department of Criminal Justice Education and Training and the related administration of justice programs prepare students for evolving roles in a diverse, dynamic, and interdependent world by offering accredited open-access, degree and certificate programs through high-quality education that is continuously evaluated and improved. Our degrees and certificates support students who transfer to 4-year institutions, those seeking entry to a career in the criminal justice system, and those incumbent criminal justice professionals wishing to advance and promote within the profession.

2. Assessment of Program's Recent Contributions to Institutional Mission:

In 2022, we developed and implemented the new Law Enforcement Career Preparation Certificate Program which specifically supports high school and college age students seeking to enter the criminal justice workforce. Students can earn work experience credit while participating in youth law enforcement cadet programs and while taking entry-level course in the administration of justice. This is a stackable certificate that supports a pathway to either the administration of justice transfer degree or the more desirable local administration of justice degree.

In addition, during this last program review cycle, we created three more stackable certificates that directly support pathways to a degree and transfer as well as providing knowledge and skills

needed by the criminal justice workforce. These program include the Law Enforcement Community Policing Certificate, Law Enforcement Mental Health and Addiction Certificate, Law Enforcement Crime Scene Investigations Certificate, and Law Enforcement Juvenile Justice Certificate.

3. Recent Program Activities Promoting the Goals of the Institutional Strategic Plan and Other Institutional Plans/Initiatives:

This fall we began offering ADMJ-120 Introduction to the Administration of Justice at New Technology High School as part of a new CCAP agreement. Although this class has been offered at this school, after school hours, for more than a decade, this is the first time the class has been made available to students during the regular school day. The goal is to expand offerings in support of the development of an Early College Program at this site. The ability to include more high school students in these classes will grow the number of students coming to Napa Valley College after graduation from high school.

C. New Objectives/Goals:

- Establish the Department of Criminal Justice Education and Training as the front-face of the college for the criminal justice/law enforcement workforce.
- Create a designated space for program offerings and activities including preserving the history of the CJTC should the program be discontinued.
- Expand CCAP offerings of classes at local high schools.
- Provide professional development for part time faculty teaching online.
- Support development of an Early College Program at New Technology High School.

D. Description of Process Used to Ensure “Inclusive Program Review”

This program review report is a culmination of input and review of data and report language by all full and part time faculty in the Department of Criminal Justice Education and Training. The area dean was included in all communications.

The process began by providing all team members a copy of the 2020 Program Review as well as all of the data provided for the 2023 review. In addition, team members received a copy of this report template and were asked for their input and reflections on the data. Each draft of this report was sent to all team members with an invitation to proof read and comment.

This report covers the following program, degrees, certificates, area(s) of study, and courses (based on the Taxonomy of Programs on file with the Office of Academic Affairs):

Program	Administration of Justice
Degrees/Certificates	911 Dispatcher: CoA
	Law Enforcement-Administration of Justice: CoA
	Law Enforcement-Community Policing: COA
	Law Enforcement-Juvenile Justice: COA
	Law Enforcement: Mental Health and Addiction: COA
Courses	Administration of Justice: AS
	Administration of Justice: AS-T
	ADMJ-120
	ADMJ-121
	ADMJ-122
	ADMJ-123
	ADMJ-124
	ADMJ-125
	ADMJ-130
	ADMJ-140
	ADMJ-190
	ADMJ-191
	ADMJ-199
	ADMJ-290
	ADMJ-291
	*CJTNC-600
	*CJTNC-610

Taxonomy of Programs, July 2022

*Note: CJTCNC-600 and CJTNC-610 are not part of the Administration of Justice Program. Both courses are part of the Criminal Justice Training Center.

I. PROGRAM DATA

A. Demand

1. Headcount and Enrollment

	2020-2021	2021-2022	2022-2023	Change over 3-Year Period
Headcount				
Within the Program	321	257	284	-11.5%
Across the Institution	7,193	6,653	6,155	-14.4%
ADMJ-120	221	170	185	-16.3%
ADMJ-121	58	49	37	-36.2%
ADMJ-122	65	41	48	-26.2%
ADMJ-123	59	41	34	-42.4%
ADMJ-124	55	55	58	5.5%
ADMJ-125	46	30	30	-34.8%
ADMJ-130	17	--	11	-35.3%
ADMJ-140	--	--	13	N/A
ADMJ-190	9	13	14	55.6%
ADMJ-191	15	7	9	-40.0%
ADMJ-199	--	--	--	--
ADMJ-290	--	--	--	--
ADMJ-291	1	2	1	0%
*CJTNC-600	--	--	--	--
*CJTNC-610	--	--	--	--
Within the Program	546	408	440	-19.4%
Across the Institution	30,381	25,212	23,473	-22.7%
<i>Source: SQL Queries for Fall 2023 Program Review</i>				

***RPIE Analysis:** The number of students enrolled (headcount) in the Administration of Justice Program decreased by 11.5% over the past three years, while headcount across the institution decreased by 14.4%. Similarly, enrollment within the Administration of Justice Program decreased by 19.4%, while enrollment across the institution decreased by 22.7%.*

Enrollment in the following courses changed by more than 10% ($\pm 10\%$) between 2020-2021 and 2022-2023:

Course with an enrollment increase:

- ADMJ-190 (55.6%)

Courses with an enrollment decrease:

- ADMJ-123 (-42.4%)
- ADMJ-191 (-40.0%)
- ADMJ-121 (-36.2%)
- ADMJ-130 (-35.3%)
- ADMJ-125 (-34.8%)
- ADMJ-122 (-26.2%)
- ADMJ-120 (-16.3%)

Program Reflection:

The time included in this program review period was perhaps the most unusual period of time in the program's history. There were a number of significant events that impacted the program and college in general and at least two events that uniquely impacted the program in a negative way. We believe that collectively these events negatively impacted the program across many of the areas reflected upon in this program review, including enrollment. For the sake of avoiding repetition, we identify them once here as follows.

- COVID Pandemic
- The fall-out from the murder of George Floyd and "anti-police" movement
- The March 2022 sudden decision to suspend the operation of the Criminal Justice Training Center
- The June 2022 "hack" of college computer systems and multiple-month shutdown of critical systems
- The spring and summer 2023 infiltration of "bots" and fraudulent student registrations in classes

There is likely little debate on how the COVID pandemic, shutdown of college computer systems during key registration periods for the fall 2022 semester, and fraudulent student bots all negatively impacted enrollment in classes across most of the college. The bots were particularly damaging as they fictitiously filled seats in classes to capacity and prevented real students from being able to register. The aggressive work to purge these fraudulent students from classes created the appearance of dramatic drop rates and left sections appearing be very under enrolled.

When the college suddenly announced the suspension of the Criminal Justice Training Center in March of 2022, it was done without a communications plan that clearly communicated to the community that administration of justice classes were not included in the suspension. We believe this decision negatively impacted enrollment in the subsequent semesters until college counselors and students came to realize the administration of justice program was alive and well.

As commented on in the last report, the anti-police sentiment in the United States continued to have broad reaching effects during this program review period. The recruitment and staffing crisis in law enforcement across the country continues today with little signs of relief. We believe this sentiment has contributed to the lower enrollment numbers in the program, but there is great hope as evidenced by the enrollment numbers for the fall of 2023.

Course	Fall 2023 Enrollment (As Of 9/8/2023)
ADMJ-120 Intro to Administration of Justice (Hybrid)	32 of 30 seats (over enrolled)
ADMJ-120 Intro to Administration of Justice (Online)	26 of 35 seats
ADMJ-120 Intro to Administration of Justice (CCAP)	25 of 35 seats
ADMJ-120 Intro to Administration of Justice (Online/8-Week Late Start)	35 of 35 seats with 5 on waitlist
ADMJ-121 Intro to Criminal Law (Hybrid)	24 of 35 seats
ADMJ-122 Intro to Criminal Procedures (Online/8-Week Late Start)	35 of 35 seats with 1 on waitlist
ADMJ-123 Intro to Community Policing (Hybrid)	21 of 35 seats
ADMJ-124 Intro to Investigations (Online)	34 of 35 seats
ADMJ-190/290 Internships (Hybrid)	16 seats between both sections

We recognize that the fall 2023 semester is not included in this program review period, but feel these enrollment numbers reflect a notable positive change in the trend that must be considered especially for planning.

This is all to say that while the enrollment trend for the program reflected in this report shows a downward trend, the enrollment numbers for fall suggest a significant turn-around. This makes sense in light of the recovery from the computer hack, early detection and remove of bots from registration, the on-going recovery from the

COVID pandemic, and realization that the suspension of the Criminal Justice Training Center does not include administration of justice programs and classes. We are also hopeful that the five new stackable certificate programs we now have available will be useful in attracting more students to the program to address the continuing recruitment crisis in the law enforcement workforce.

2. Average Class Size

	2020-2021		2021-2022		2022-2023		Three-Year	
	Sections	Average Size	Sections	Average Size	Sections	Average Size	Average Section Size	Trend
ADMJ-120	7	31.6	7	24.3	8	23.1	26.2	-26.8%
ADMJ-121	2	29.0	2	24.5	2	18.5	24.0	-36.2%
ADMJ-122	2	32.5	2	20.5	2	24.0	25.7	-26.2%
ADMJ-123	2	29.5	2	20.5	2	17.0	22.3	-42.4%
ADMJ-124	2	27.5	2	27.5	2	29.0	28.0	5.5%
ADMJ-125	2	23.0	2	15.0	2	15.0	17.7	-34.8%
ADMJ-130	1	17.0	--	N/A	1	11.0	14.0	-35.3%
ADMJ-140	--	N/A	--	N/A	1	13.0	13.0	--
ADMJ-190	1	9.0	1	13.0	2	7.0	9.0	-22.2%
ADMJ-191/-291	2	8.0	1	9.0	1	10.0	8.8	25.0%
Program Average*	21	26.0	19	21.5	23	19.1	22.1	-26.5%
Institutional Average*	1,199	25.3	1,112	22.7	1,009	23.3	23.8	-8.2%

Sources: SQL Queries for Fall 2023 Program Review for enrollment data, Enrollment Management Division Reports and Concurrent Courses Reports for course-section data.

Average Section Size across the three-year period for courses, and both within academic years and across the three-year period for the program and institutional levels is calculated as:

$$\frac{\text{Total \# Enrollments.}}{\text{Total \# Sections}}$$

It is not the average of the three annual averages.

RPIE Analysis: Over the past three years, the Administration of Justice Program has claimed an average of 22.1 students per section. The average class size in the program is lower than the average class size of 23.8 students per section across the institution during this period. Average class size in the program decreased by 26.5% between 2020-2021 and 2022-2023. Average class size at the institutional level decreased by 8.2% over the same period.

Average class size in the following courses changed by more than 10% ($\pm 10\%$) between 2020-2021 and 2022-2023:

Course with an increase in average class size:

- ADMJ-190 (25.0%)

Courses with decreases in average class size:

- ADMJ-123 (-42.4%)

- ADMJ-121 (-36.2%)
- ADMJ-130 (-35.3%)
- ADMJ-125 (-34.8%)
- ADMJ-120 (-26.8%)
- ADMJ-122 (-26.2%)
- ADMJ-190 (-22.2%)

Program Reflection:

Most of the reflection for this section includes what has already been said in the previous section. During this program review period, we did not offer any class that is not required for the transfer degree, our local degree or one of our certificate programs.

ADMJ-123 Introduction to Community Policing is a required course for the new Law Enforcement Community Policing Certificate, but only an elective for the transfer degree which may account for the higher decrease in enrollment. AB846 signed into law in 2021 and the California Racial and Identity Profiling Act report for 2022 and 2023 all call for increased cultural diversity and bias and racism prevention training; subjects all covered in this course. We offer it twice per year in different formats (hybrid and fully online) in order to meet the needs of different student populations. In this post George Floyd period, community policing is a critical subject area for new an incumbent criminal justice professional. There is a proposal to move this course to be a requirement for the transfer degree, but the final approval of this change at the state level continues to wait.

During the COVID lockdown, criminal justice agencies were not accepting students for internships. ADMJ-190, 191, 290 and 291 suffered. Incumbent criminal justice employees continued to work and were able to complete internship requirements.

We believe the fall enrollment numbers show promise for a recovery. We plan to continue monitoring this trend and will consider adjustments in the number of section offerings accordingly.

3. Fill Rate and Productivity

Fill Rate			
	Enrollments	Capacity	Fill Rate
2020-2021	546	890	61.3%
2021-2022	408	720	56.7%
2022-2023	440	818	53.8%
Three-Year Program Total	1,394	2,428	57.4%
Productivity			
	FTES	FTEF	Productivity
2020-2021	57.7	3.9	14.8
2021-2022	41.5	3.6	11.5
2022-2023	47.6	4.5	10.6
Three-Year Program Total	146.8	12.0	12.2
Sources: SQL Queries for Fall 2023 Program Review; SQL Server Reporting Services – Term to Term Enrollment FTES Load Comparison Report (by Credit Course)			

RPIE Analysis: Between 2020-2021 and 2022-2023, the fill rate within the Administration of Justice Program ranged from 53.8% to 61.3%. (The fill rate has

not been calculated at the institutional level.) The program-level fill rate decreased across the three-year period. The rate across the three years was 57.4%. Between 2020-2021 and 2021-2022, both enrollment and capacity decreased, resulting in a decrease in fill rate (due to a higher rate of decrease in enrollment). Between 2021-2022 and 2022-2023, both enrollment and capacity increased, resulting in a decrease in fill rate (due to a higher rate of increase in capacity).

Productivity within the Administration of Justice Program decreased from 14.8 to 10.6 over the three-year period. (Productivity has not been calculated at the institutional level.) The three-year program productivity of 12.2 is lower than the target level of 17.5, which reflects 1 FTEF (full-time equivalent faculty) accounting for 17.5 FTES (full-time equivalent students) across the academic year. (This target reflects 525 weekly student contact hours for one full-time student across the academic year.)

Program Reflection:

The Department of Criminal Justice Education and Training includes one full time faculty member and 4 part time faculty members (most assigned to teach just one class each). This is a reduction of two part time faculty members. Again, as described in the reflection for A.1, productivity was negatively impacted by all of the factors mentioned.

The full-time faculty member carries an overload assignment on a continuous basis. We believe or use of part time faculty continues to provide great flexibility for expansion and contraction. Every one of our faculty members has a Master's Degree and decades of on-the-job law enforcement experience. Most have worked from the line level to administrative or executive level. Everyone teaching remains current in the field by participating in professional subject matter expert associations, consulting with local and state agencies, and other related forms of professional development. Unlike other disciplines at the college, we are truly fortunate to have a large pool of qualified and interested teachers to assign as needed.

We continue to acknowledge that we have two distinct student populations including those who prefer face-to-face instruction and another that prefers online classes. We have entry-level students preparing for a career and incumbent members of the workforce who work shifts and cannot attend class on campus. In order to make our degrees and certificates accessible to these different populations of students, must continue to balance the schedule with face-to-face and online formatted classes.

4. Labor Market Demand

Economic Development Department Standard Occupational Classification Description Codes: 33-3000 (Law Enforcement Workers), 33-3012 (Correctional Officers and Jailers), 33-3051 (Police and Sheriff's Patrol Officers), 33-9000 (Other Protective Service Workers), 43-5000 (Material Recording, Scheduling, Dispatching, and	Numeric Change in Employment (Baseline Year to Projected Year)	Projected Growth (% Change in Positions; 2020 Base Employment vs. 2030 Projected Employment)	Projected Number of Positions (Total Job Openings)
---	--	---	--

Distributing Workers), 43-5031 (Police, Fire, and Ambulance Dispatchers)			
Napa County (2020-2030)	400	16.1%	3,420
Bay Area ^A (2020-2030)	12,910	9.5%	165,300
California (2020-2030)	60,200	8.5%	862,460
<i>Source: Economic Development Department Labor Market Information, Occupational Data, Occupational Projections (http://www.labormarketinfo.edd.ca.gov)</i> ^A Bay Area counties include: Alameda, Contra Costa, Marin, San Francisco, San Mateo, Santa Clara, Solano, and Sonoma. Figures also include San Benito County (reported with projections for Santa Clara County).			

***RPIE Analysis:** The figures reported in the table above pertain to the Standard Occupational Classification for the following positions:*

- Law Enforcement Workers
- Correctional Officers and Jailers
- Police and Sheriff's Patrol Officers
- Other Protective Service Workers
- Material Recording, Scheduling, Dispatching, and Distributing Workers
- Police, Fire, and Ambulance Dispatchers

The Economic Development Department projects an increase of 400 positions within Napa County and an increase of 12,910 positions within the Bay Area for the Administration of Justice Program by 2030 (compared to 2020). These increases in the number of positions translate to a 16.1% increase for the industry within Napa County and a 9.5% increase within the Bay Area (not including Napa County). The projected growth within the Bay Area (9.5%) is slightly higher than the projected growth in California (8.5%).

Program Reflection:

The degree and certificate programs offered by the Department of Criminal Justice Education and Training prepare students for entry into all of the jobs listed above. The program advisory committee has told us that recruitment for new employees is their greatest challenge, thus the reasoning for supporting the creation of the new Law Enforcement Career Preparation Certificate Program. The challenges with recruitment extend way beyond the borders of Napa County as evidenced by the data provided above.

The criminal justice workforce depends on the community college system as a whole to provide educated applicants to fill vacant positions. We do our part by making sure courses are accessible for as many different student populations as possible including those who live outside of Napa County. With the exception of the new ADMJ-140 Intro to Crime Scene Investigation course, all of our classes are part of the C-ID and transfer degree curriculum. This supports students from all over the state to fulfill transfer requirements using our courses.

Should the college discontinue the Criminal Justice Training Center for good, the criminal justice workforce will have an even greater dependence on our programs and courses for both career preparation and recruitment. This will increase our profile within the workforce.

B. Momentum

1. Retention and Successful Course Completion Rates

	Retention Rates (Across Three Years)			Successful Course Completion Rates (Across Three Years)		
Course	Rate	Course Rate vs. Program Rate		Rate	Course Rate vs. Program Rate	
		Above	Below		Above	Below
ADMJ-120	86.6%		X	51.2%		X
ADMJ-121	95.1%	X		77.6%	X	
ADMJ-122	99.3%	X		74.8%	X	
ADMJ-123	90.0%		--	70.8%	X	
ADMJ-124	95.2%	X		70.8%	X	
ADMJ-125	92.3%	X		74.0%	X	
ADMJ-130	89.3%		X	71.4%	X	
ADMJ-140	92.3%	X		84.6%	X	
ADMJ-190	75.8%		X	39.4%		X
ADMJ-191	86.7%		X	60.0%		X
ADMJ-291	75.0%		X	50.0%		X
Program Level	90.5%			63.2%		
Institutional Level	90.0%			72.7%		
Source: SQL Queries for Fall 2023 Program Review						
-- Indicates a value that is within 1% of the program-level rate.						
Bold italics denote a statistically significant difference between the course-level rate and the program-level rate.						
Bold denotes a statistically significant difference between the program-level rate and the institutional rate. The lower of the two rates is highlighted in bold.						
Note: Grades of EW (Excused Withdrawal) for spring 2020 and beyond are not included in the calculations of the three-year retention and successful course completion rates reported above. This approach reflects the standard recommended research practice of not including EWs in either the numerator or the denominator for these rates.						

RPIE Analysis: Over the past three years, the retention rate for the Administration of Justice Program reflected the retention rate at the institutional level. The retention rates for ADMJ-120 and ADMJ-190 were significantly lower than the program-level rate. The retention rates for ADMJ-121, ADMJ-122, and ADMJ-124 were significantly higher than the program-level rate. The retention rate for the Administration of Justice Program falls within the second quartile (Q2) among program-level retention rates (across 58 instructional programs, over the past three years). The retention rate for Administration of Justice is among the lowest 50% of retention rates among NVC programs.

Over the past three years, the successful course completion rate for the Administration of Justice Program was significantly lower than the rate at the institutional level. The successful course completion rates for ADMJ-120 and ADMJ-190 were significantly lower than the program-level rate. Administration of Justice courses with successful course completion rates significantly higher than the program-level rate are noted in the table above. The successful course completion rate for Administration of Justice falls within the first quartile (Q1) among program-level successful course completion rates (across 58 instructional programs, over the past three years). The successful course completion rate for Administration of Justice is among the lowest 25% of successful course completion rates among NVC programs.

Over the past three years, the difference between retention and successful course completion at the program level (27.3%) was significantly higher than the difference at the institutional level (17.3%). This figure represents the proportion of non-passing grades assigned to students at the end of the semester (i.e., grades of D, F, I, NP).

The following Administration of Justice courses claimed a difference (between retention and successful course completion) that exceeded the 17.3% difference found at the institutional level:

- ADMJ-190 (36.4%)
- ADMJ-120 (35.4%)
- ADMJ-191 (26.7%)
- ADMJ-291 (25.0%)
- ADMJ-122 (24.5%)
- ADMJ-124 (24.4%)
- ADMJ-123 (19.2%)
- ADMJ-125 (18.3%)
- ADMJ-130 (17.9%)

Program Reflection:

For at least half of this program review period, instruction was conducted fully online either asynchronously or synchronously via Zoom. The reality is that some students survived and others failed. Again, it was a highly unusual period of time with teachers and students trying to figure it all out. Overall, learning online for a new online learner is difficult under normal circumstances. During the COVID pandemic, it was simply overwhelming.

We did continue to offer ADMJ-120 Intro to Administration of Justice at two high schools and continued to experience the same high level of student failure. In talking with the faculty teaching these classes, we know the primary reason for failure was for simply not doing most or all of the required work. The expectations of a high school class and a college class are different and we've known this for a long time.

What is promising, however, is the change we are seeing this fall with the offering of ADMJ-120 as a CCAP class during the regular school day with support services available from high school staff. Faculty report already that it is making a world of difference with student success. Time will tell if this continues to be true.

For The ADMJ-190/191/290/291 Internship classes, almost all were disrupted in March of 2020 with the COVID lockdown. Every agency eliminated internships except for those individuals who were employees. This likely accounts for the lower completion figures.

2. Student Equity

	Retention Rates (Across Three Years)		Successful Course Completion Rates (Across Three Years)	
	Program Level	Institution Level	Program Level	Institution Level
African American/Black	91.4%	87.7%	65.5%	65.9%
Pacific Islander	*	86.7%		
Latinx/Hispanic			60.5%	69.0%
19 or Younger			61.4%	71.0%
First-Generation			56.3%	69.7%

Not Disabled/Not Reported			63.3%	72.5%
<i>Source: SQL Queries for Fall 2023 Program Review</i> <i>Bold italics</i> denote a statistically significant difference between rates at the program and institutional levels, with the lower of the two rates in <i>bold italics</i>. *Data suppressed due to low N (<10 students in cohort). Notes: Grades of EW (Excused Withdrawal) for spring 2020 and beyond are not included in the calculations of the three-year retention and successful course completion rates reported above. This approach reflects the standard recommended research practice of not including EWs in either the numerator or the denominator for these rates. The age groupings are based on the student's age of August 15 of each academic year. The shaded cells in the table do not have data reported because evidence of disproportionate impact was not found at the institutional level (for those demographic group – metric combinations).				

***RPIE Analysis:** This analysis of student equity focuses on the six demographic groups with significantly lower retention and/or successful course completion rates found at the institutional level (vs. the corresponding rates among all other demographic groups, combined) over the past three years. Tests of statistical significance were conducted to compare program-level and institution-level rates among the six groups listed above.*

Within the Administration of Justice Program, the retention rate among African American/Black students was higher than the rate at the institutional level. (The difference was not statistically significant.) [Due to the low number of Pacific Islanders enrolled in the Administration of Justice Program over the past three years, this analysis does not include comparison of program-level and institution-level retention rates for Pacific Islanders.]

Within the Administration of Justice Program, the successful course completion rate among African American/Black students within the program reflected the rate at the institutional level. The program-level successful course completion rates among Latinx/Hispanic students, students 19 or younger, first-generation students, and students without a disability reported were significantly lower than the corresponding rates at the institutional level.

These findings regarding equity groups reflect the findings that emerged from the comparison of retention and successful course completion at the program vs. institutional level, where the program-level retention rate reflected the institution-level rate and the program-level successful course completion rate was significantly lower than the institution-level rate. (See Section I.B.1 above.)

Program Reflection:

3. Retention and Successful Course Completion Rates by Delivery Mode (of Courses Taught through Multiple Delivery Modes, i.e., In-Person, Hybrid, and Online)

	Retention Rates (Across Three Years)			Successful Course Completion Rates (Across Three Years)		
	In-Person	Online	Hybrid	In-Person	Online	Hybrid
In-Person vs. Online						
In-Person vs. Hybrid						

Source: *SQL Queries for Fall 2023 Program Review*

This table compares student performance in courses offered through multiple delivery modes within the same academic year.

Bold italics denote a significantly lower rate within that delivery mode.

Note: The analysis of retention and successful course completion by delivery mode does not include spring 2020 – spring 2021 because most courses shifted to an online/hybrid delivery mode beginning in spring 2020 due to the COVID-19 pandemic (thereby blurring the distinction between delivery modes).

RPIE Analysis:

Program Reflection:

In reviewing the data from the current program review period and that of the last one, addressing the disparities in student success continues to be important. In talking with program faculty, we believe the lower completion rates for Latinx, under 19, and first generation students reflects the high school student population in our ADMJ-120 Intro to the Administration of Justice classes held on high school campuses as well as of those high school students taking classes online. Of course, the COVID pandemic and move to fully asynchronous and synchronous instruction via Zoom likely lowered the number of successful completions.

We acknowledge the potential equity issues related here including lack of access to reliable technology including computers and Internet access. Despite this equipment being available for loan from the college library, high school students especially cannot easily access these resources.

The promising change in this area appears to be with having CCAP classes offered during the regular high school day with high school counselors and staff engaged to help students with the basic needs for access (both equipment and how to use the various college systems including Canvas). While this support exists on the main campus, it doesn't exist in remote locations like high schools outside of the high school day. Faculty report that the support of high school staff is already making a huge difference with students being able to access technology of all types.

As we continue to expand CCAP classes, we need to assign faculty who really understand the high school student, high school culture, and how to work with high school staff. This includes assigning faculty who reflect the student population, including the LatinX population, when possible.

One of our goals from the last program review report was to examine the viability of short-term 8-week fully online classes. The original intent was to support especially incumbent workers who were finishing a degree or certificate by providing a "fast track" to program completion. Faculty report very mixed results with these 8-week classes. For ADMJ-123 Intro to Community Policing, the 8-week class format was popular, but had a lower level of student success. We discontinued offering this class in that format. For ADMJ-120, Intro to Administration of Justice, the 8-week format serves a population of students who register late, student athletes, and returning incumbent members of the criminal justice workforce who work shifts and cannot get to campus when classes meet in person. Overall, what faculty agree on is that the 8-week format works for some classes, based on content, but not for all. We will continue to offer this format on a limited basis.

What we have found great success with are 16-week hybrid format classes that provide regular face-to-face contact with an instructor with the balance of instruction provided online. We found that scheduling pairs of hybrid classes within the same time block enables students to take two classes while spending the time on campus required for one class. For example, we schedule a hybrid offering of ADMJ-121 Intro to Criminal Law with a class meeting on Tuesdays from 9:30-11:00 and a hybrid offering of ADMJ-123 Intro to Community Policing with a class meeting on Thursdays from 9:30-11:00. Faculty agree that this format provides a good

balance of instructional methodology and format without compromising student success. We look forward to adding more pairs of classes using this format.

C. Student Achievement

1. Program Completion

	2020-2021	2021-2022	2022-2023
Degrees			
Administration of Justice: AS	17	20	9
Administration of Justice: AS-T	27	16	14
Institutional: AS Degrees	394	304	280
Institutional: AS-T Degrees	131	110	111
Certificates			
911 Dispatcher: CoA	1	--	--
Law Enforcement – ADMJ CoA	6	--	2
Law Enforcement – Community Policing CoA	--	--	--
Law Enforcement – Juvenile Justice CoA	--	--	1
Law Enforcement: Mental Health & Addiction CoA	--	--	--
Institutional: Certificates of Achievement	508	405	377
<i>Source: SQL Queries for Fall 2023 Program Review</i>			

***RPIE Analysis:** The number of AS degrees conferred by the Administration of Justice Program decreased by 47.1% between 2020-2021 and 2022-2023. Over the same period, the number of AS degrees conferred by the institution decreased by 28.9%. The Administration of Justice Program accounted for 4.3% of the AS degrees conferred in 2020-2021 and 3.2% of those conferred in 2022-2023.*

The number of AS-T degrees conferred by the Administration of Justice Program decreased by 48.1% between 2020-2021 and 2022-2023. Over the same period, the number of AS-T degrees conferred by the institution decreased by 15.3%. The Administration of Justice Program accounted for 20.6% of the AS-T degrees conferred in 2020-2021 and 12.6% of those conferred in 2022-2023.

The number of certificates of achievement conferred by the Administration of Justice Program decreased by 57.1% between 2020-2021 and 2022-2023. Over the same period, the number of certificates conferred by the institution decreased by 25.8%. The Administration of Justice Program accounted for 1.4% of the certificates conferred in 2020-2021 and 0.8% of those conferred in 2022-2023.

Program Reflection:

It is not surprising that the number of degrees and certificates awarded dropped during this program review period as many of the factors stated in section A.1 apply here as well. We did add five new certificate programs during this program review period. The Law Enforcement Career Preparation Certificate and Crime

Scene Investigations Certificate were approved last year and became available this fall. The other three new certificate programs became available for the first time last year.

We updated our program web page, created a new program brochure, and created a new flyer specifically about these new certificate program. The program coordinator met with the Counseling Division to educate counselors about the new certificates.

This fall, the program coordinator sent a welcome email to every student enrolled in every administration of justice class with detailed information about the degrees and certificate programs available. The email included links and an explanation for how to apply for a degree or certificate. We intend this to be a regular practice at the start of every fall and spring semester in an effort to market the new programs and increase the number of awards.

The 9-1-1 Dispatcher Certificate Program is being considered for discontinuance as part of the discontinuance process for the Criminal Justice Training Center. The core course required for this certificate is one certified by the California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training (POST) and has historically been presented by the Criminal Justice Training Center, not the Department of Criminal Justice Education and Training. This course was recently updated by POST and expanded by 40 hours. Our department is not able to sustain offering this course due to a lack of dispatchers who are qualified to teach it. We will archive the 9-1-1 Dispatcher Certificate Program if the Criminal Justice Training Center is discontinued.

2. Program-Set Standards: Job Placement and Licensure Exam Pass Rates

Measure	Program-Set Standard* (& Stretch Goal)	Recent Performance			
		Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Three-Year Total
Job Placement Rate	70% (90%)	83.0%	97.4%	89.2%	90.9%
Licensure Exam Pass Rate	Licensure exams are not required for this program.				
Sources: Perkins IV Core 4 Employment data for Program (TOP Code: 210500) for job placement rates (https://misweb.cccco.edu/perkins/Core_Indicator_Reports/Summ_CoreIndi_TOPCode.aspx)					

RPIE Analysis: Among Administration of Justice students, job placement rates have consistently exceeded the program-set standard (of 70%). The job placement rate exceeded the stretch goal (of 90%) in one of the past three years.

Program Reflection:

These numbers are not a huge surprise given what we know about the number of vacant jobs especially within law enforcement. If the Criminal Justice Training Center is discontinued, there will be a greater reliance by local criminal justice employers on our program. Previously, recruitment was handled almost exclusively by the Criminal Justice Training Center. A job board was made available to employers and students.

We will need to look for ways to replace access to that information for both employers and our students in order to continue contributing to the workforce. This means having a designated place for employers to meet and present to students and for students to access job information.

II. CURRICULUM

A. Courses

Subject	Course Number	Date of Last Review & Approval by Curriculum Committee (Courses with last review dates of 6 years or more must be scheduled for immediate review)	Has Prerequisite/ Corequisite* Yes/No & Date of Last Review	In Need of Revision Indicate Non-Substantive (NS) or Substantive (S) & Academic Year Anticipated	To Be Archived (as Obsolete, Outdated, or Irrelevant) & Academic Year Anticipated	No Change
ADMJ	120	11/19/2021 (CC)	No	2027		x
ADMJ	121	3/3/2023 (CC)	Yes	2025		x
ADMJ	122	11/19/2021 (CC)	No	2027		x
ADMJ	123	11/5/2021 (CC)	No	2027		x
ADMJ	124	11/19/2021 (CC)	No	2027		x
ADMJ	125	11/19/2021 (CC)	No	2027		x
ADMJ	130	11/19/2021 (CC)	No	2027		x
ADMJ	140	9/2/2022 (CC) New	No	2027		x
ADMJ	190	11/15/2019 (CC)	No	2025		x
ADMJ	191	11/15/2019 (CC)	No	2025		x
ADMJ	199	Cannot find	Yes	Archived In 2023		X
ADMJ	290	11/15/2019 (CC)	No	2025		x
ADMJ	291	11/15/2019 (CC)	No	2025		x

*Note: Prerequisites need to be validated (in subsequent process) through Curriculum Committee.

B. Degrees and Certificates*

Degree or Certificate & Title	Implementation Date	Has Documentation Yes/No	In Need of Revision+ and/or Missing Documentation & Academic Year Anticipated	To Be Archived* (as Obsolete, Outdated, or Irrelevant) & Academic Year Anticipated	No Change
Administration of Justice: AS		No	2023		X
Administration of Justice: AS-T		Yes			X
911 Dispatcher: COA		Yes		Subject to discontinuance in 2023	
Law Enforcement-Administration of Justice: COA		Narrative only, no CTE documentation	2023		X
Law Enforcement-Career Preparation: COA	FA23	Yes			X

Law Enforcement-Community Policing: COA	FA22	Yes			X
Law Enforcement-Crime Scene Investigation: COA	FA23	Yes			X
Law Enforcement-Juvenile Justice: COA	FA22	Yes			X
Law Enforcement-Mental Health and Addiction: COA	FA22	Yes			x

*Note: Discontinuance or archival of degrees or certificates must go through the Program Discontinuance process or the Program Archival Task Force.

+Degrees and Certificates cannot be implemented until the required courses in them are approved and active.

Program Reflection:

We completed a major curriculum revision in 2019 and 2021 that included overhauling all course and program level learning outcomes (more on that in the next section). Two additional new certificate programs were approved last spring and available this fall that do not appear on this list including the Law Enforcement Career Preparation Certificate and the Crime Scene Investigations Certificate.

If the Criminal Justice Training Program is discontinued this fall, we will archive the 9-1-1 Dispatcher Certificate Program in the spring of 2024. CJT-296 9-1-1 Dispatcher was last offered in the fall of 2022. All of the other required courses for this certificate are within the administration justice area and continue to be offered, so students starting the certificate in the fall of 2022 will be able to finish the certificate if they wish without an impact on the program.

We cannot explain why documentation is not available for the programs listed as they were all approved through the curriculum committee process, Bay AREA BACC process, and Chancellor's Office, which means the missing documents did exist, but have been lost along the way. These documents are not maintained by our program.

In the coming three years, it is likely we will see a state level Modern Policing Degree required pursuant to Assembly Bill 89 signed into law 2022. This degree and its requirements will be similar to the transfer degree model. It is possible that it will actually replace the transfer degree, but much is still unknown about what it will finally include. Aside from any requirements created by this new degree, we do not anticipate adding new classes or certificates in the next three years.

III. LEARNING OUTCOMES ASSESSMENT

A. Status of Learning Outcomes Assessment

Learning Outcomes Assessment at the Course Level

	Number of Courses with Outcomes Assessed		Proportion of Courses with Outcomes Assessed	
Number of Courses	Over Last 4 Years	Over Last 6 Years	Over Last 4 Years	Over Last 6 Years
13	10	12	77%	92%

Learning Outcomes Assessment at the Program/Degree/Certificate Level

Degree/Certificate	Number of Outcomes*	Number of Outcomes Assessed		Proportion of Outcomes Assessed	
		Over Last 4 Years	Over Last 6 Years	Over Last 4 Years	Over Last 6 Years
911 Dispatcher: CoA	2	2	2	100%	100%
Law Enforcement-Administration of Justice: CoA	6	1	1	17%	17%
Law Enforcement-Community Policing: COA					
Law Enforcement-Juvenile Justice: COA					
Law Enforcement: Mental Health and Addiction: COA	6	3	4	50%	67%
Administration of Justice: AS					
Administration of Justice: AS-T					

Program Reflection:

In 2021, we completed a complete review and update of all administration of justice courses. This review included making course content updates to comply with a variety of laws passed related to law enforcement reform. We completely overhauled the course level outcomes and program level outcomes so they reflect the updated content as well as current needs of transfer institutions and the criminal justice workforce.

Most notably, we aligned program level outcomes with course level outcomes by using one common set of 6 outcomes. In other words, the course outcomes match program outcomes as they relate to the content of any given course. The goal was to make alignment between courses and the program more clear and to facilitate a more accurate assessment of program level outcomes across the program. Our goal is to focus on one program level outcome every year and to assess all of the courses that include that common outcome. We completed this process in 2022 and 2023. This accounts for why the percentages of outcomes assessed is not 100%. It is because these are all new outcomes.

B. Summary of Learning Outcomes Assessment Findings and Actions

In 2022, the program coordinator started creating a common assessment that faculty could decide to use to assess the outcome selected for the year. This not only makes it easier for faculty, but provides a common method of assessment that can be used across multiple classes. The data collected from multiple sections and classes can then be measured using a common set of metrics for a program level assessment.

Overall, our students are performing well across the program level outcomes. We have not identified anything specifically related to the curriculum or methods of instruction that warrants change. Faculty continue to discuss the assessment results and we all agree that the weakest area of student performance is writing. One faculty member teaching the ADMJ-120 Introduction to Administration of Justice course at a high school moved away from weekly essay questions to multiple-choice quizzes. Writing is still required in the class in the form of a term paper and short essay questions on the mid-term and final exam, but student success in the classes increased. The faculty member believes the quizzes more accurately helped students prepare for the high-stakes mid-term and final exam. The quizzes measure knowledge without consideration of weak writing skills.

Program Reflection:

The program coordinator's goal is to integrate an assessment method into every course so that it can be measured every semester. Over the next three years, we hope to have developed at least one assessment method for every outcome that can be used in every course that outcome appears. This will make it very easy for faculty to complete assessments.

IV. PROGRAM HIGHLIGHTS

The program-level plan that emerged from the last review (fall 2020) included the following initiatives:

- Work with the academic senate to support adjusting registration priorities so that high school students taking on their high school campus can register earlier in order to better predict and manage enrollments in classes held on high school campuses.
- Experiment with scheduling evening courses as either hybrid or synchronous online in order to attract more interest in evening courses.
- Work with RPIE to track enrollment, retention, and success in 8-week online classes to determine viability and value long- term.
- Develop a course orientation specifically for classes presented on high school campuses with high numbers of high school students focused on how to be successful in college courses.
- Explore the use of Starfish in order to determine students who are likely to fail early on in a course.
- Experiment by scheduling ADM-123 and ADMJ-124 as a hybrid course with a 90-minute face-to-face meeting instead of 3 hours each week.
- Experiment by moving the 8-week version of ADM123, currently offered in the spring, to the summer semester. This will provide one section of this course in each semester (fall, spring and summer).
- Work with the C-ID transfer degree review process currently underway to include ADMJ-123 as a required course instead of an elective.
- During the curriculum review planned for early 2021, evaluate the course content, assignments, and methods of evaluation to determine if the class caps for ADMJ-120 are appropriate.
- Identify formalized training beyond the basic required training for new online instructors for part time faculty teaching online at any level that emphasizes strategies used online that result in student success. This could include @One. In all cases, funding will be needed to pay for the course tuition and stipends for part time faculty to attend.
- Explore options for using learning communities that link Puente and Umoja program participants with administration of justice careers and classes.
- Conduct outreach presentations for ethnic base student clubs on campus to stimulate and attract interest.
- Explore professional development opportunities for program faculty that offer strategies on how best to support students of color and underrepresented groups. This will at least require funding for tuition.
- Identify additional methods of communicating with online students
- Revise the 9-1-1 Dispatcher Certificate Program.
- Create a webpage and marketing materials for the 9-1-1 Dispatcher Certificate Program.
- Explore options for creating lower unit certificates as a pathway to degree completion and successful entry to one of the existing entry-level criminal academies.
- Work with RPIE to obtain annually an email list of all students taking administration of justice courses so that direct communications about certificate and degree options can be sent.
- Continue working with local law enforcement executives to promote use of our Internship classes in order to expose employers to our students and our students to potential employers.
- Work closely with the criminal justice advisory committee to identify emerging new criminal justice jobs created as a result of the “defunding” movement to ensure NVC is positioned to provide any required training.
- Meet with the criminal justice advisory committee to gather input on program outcomes and content from local law enforcement executives.
- Modify individual courses as needed and prepare updates for all courses to include at least current textbook and learning outcomes.
- Complete the approval process for the pending Juvenile Justice Certificate program.

- Develop a low-unit certificate program that strengthens the pathway to a degree perhaps in the area of forensics, cultural competence, or crisis intervention related to mental health or addiction.
- Work with program faculty to identify additional assessment methods within each course using existing assignments, quizzes, and course activities.
- Work toward collecting assessment data every time a course is offered.
- Develop immediately alternative assessment methods for ADMJ-121 Introduction to Criminal Law.
- Identify ways of assessing work ethic in other program courses, perhaps by adopting program level student performance standards (eg. not accepting late work).
- Explore the formation of a learning community with the English Department and ADMJ-120 Introduction to the Administration of Justice in order to strengthen discipline related writing skills.
- Explore ways to work with high school counselors in order to educate high school students on the differences in expectations between high school and college classes, perhaps by requiring completion of a college readiness course before enrollment in an administration of justice class.

*Items highlighted in green have been accomplished in some form.

A. Accomplishments/Achievements Associated with Most Recent Three-Year Program-Level Plan

- Development and implementation of five new stackable certificates.
- Complete revision of the program curriculum including program and course level learning outcomes.
- Development of two common assessments to measure outcomes across multiple sections and classes (Including ADMJ-121).
- Presentation of ADMJ-120 Intro to Administration of Justice as a CCAP course.
- Scheduling pairs of hybrid courses using the same time block to increase efficiency and enrollment.

B. Recent Improvements

- New department name “Department of Criminal Justice Education and Training” to reflect the focus of our degree and certificate programs.
- Program coordinator generated emails to every student enrolled in a program course advertising degree and certificate options.
- Development of a new program brochure.

C. Effective Practices

- Working in partnership with other departments to create new stackable certificates using existing courses and without requiring additional resources.
- Working in partnership with the CTE Office and high school staff to increase student success in college courses within a CCAP agreement.
- Aligning program level outcomes with course level outcomes to better align course content with program level outcomes and to facilitate assessment across multiple sections and courses.
- Development of common assessment methods that can be easily embedded into courses without adding work for faculty that allow for regular assessment of courses.

V. PROGRAM PLAN

Based on the information included in this document, the program is described as being in a state of:

- ☐ Viability
- ☒ Stability
- ☐ Growth

*Please select ONE of the above.

This evaluation of the state of the program is supported by the following parts of this report:

A.1
A.4
B.1
B.2
C.1
C.2

Complete Columns A – D of the 3-Year Program Planning Template (Excel file accompanying this report) to outline the three-year plan for the program. For the fall 2023 program review cycle, the 3-year program plan will span 2024-2025 through 2026-2027.

COLUMN A	COLUMN B	COLUMN C	COLUMN D
Program/Service	Unit-Level Initiative	Anticipated Year of Implementation	Anticipated Outcome of Initiative

VI. RESOURCES NEEDED TO IMPLEMENT PROGRAM PLAN

- A. Describe the current state of program resources relative to the plan outlined above. (Resources include: personnel, technology, equipment, facilities, operating budget, training, and library/learning materials.) Identify any anticipated resource needs (beyond the current levels) necessary to implement the plan outlined above.

Description of Current Program Resources Relative to Plan:

If the Criminal Justice Training Center is discontinued, the Department of Criminal Justice Education and Training will position itself to be the front-facing representative of the college to the criminal justice workforce and specifically the law enforcement community. We will need a dedicated physical space to facilitate access for recruiters and students. We have a strong desire to preserve, at some level, the 40-year history of the Criminal Justice Training Center. While it may be discontinued, it produced thousands of highly successful criminal justice professionals including many police chiefs who are currently leading law enforcement agencies throughout the Bay Area. The college should be proud of this work and keep this legacy visible for the community.

The ADMJ-140 Intro to Crime Scene Investigations course and related certificate program have needs for lab space and equipment and supply storage. We believe this program will increase in popularity and lead to a second offering each year.

To meet these needs, we request one of the former police academy classrooms and adjoining offices be designated for use by the Department of Criminal Justice Education and Training and for all administration of justice classes. Within that space we can facilitate recruiting and job placement as well as have space to house artifacts representing the history of the Criminal Justice Training Center.

There is an on-going need to provide professional development for faculty on effective strategies for teaching online and using Canvas. Funding to compensate especially part time faculty for completing training above and beyond the minimum requirements can help improve the quality of instruction online.

- B. Complete Columns E – F of the 3-Year Program Planning Template to identify the resources needed in order to implement each unit-level initiative. If more than one type of resource (e.g., operating expenses, technology, supplies, facilities, equipment, etc.) is needed to implement the initiative, list them on consecutive rows following the unit-level initiative.

Note: Resources to support program plans are allocated through the annual planning and resource allocation process (not the program review process).

The completed 3-Year Program Planning Template will serve as a draft/starting point for upcoming annual planning and resource allocation cycles.

COLUMN A	COLUMN B	COLUMN C	COLUMN D	COLUMN E	COLUMN F
Program/ Service	Unit-Level Initiative	Anticipated Year of Implementation	Anticipated Outcome of Initiative	Description of Resource Need	Type of Resource Need

Supplemental Information

We acknowledge that fee-based workforce training courses and programming are not typically part of program review. Historically, the Department of Criminal Justice Education and Training has not provided fee-based or non-credit classes. In this truly unusual period, the department did pick-up responsibility for the delivery of in-service law enforcement workforce training when the Criminal Justice Training Center was suddenly closed in June of 2022. For the sake of future planning, we feel it is important to share our experience and discuss why this effort largely failed. Should the Criminal Justice Training Center be permanently discontinued, the college will need to decide if and how to provide in-service workforce training for law enforcement.

History

Following the suspension and closure of the Criminal Justice Training Center in June of 2022, the Department of Criminal Justice Education and Training stepped up and assumed responsibility for providing in-service law enforcement workforce training. Based on a training needs assessment conducted via the program advisory committee, we identified 11 courses and scheduled a total of 24 classes during the 2022/2023 school year to meet the identified needs. We created a website and automated registration process using Eventbrite for agencies to use to register personnel. This was necessary because there was no college staff available to field phone calls, process registrations, or issue invoices for course fees. The costs of coordination, instruction, and materials were all factored into the course fees, so the program was completely funded by course fees. The problem though is that a coordinator was only paid if a class got sufficient enrollment to run. If a class was canceled, all of the work to prepare for the class, getting is certified, scheduling instructors, and advertizing the course could not be compensated. Out of the 24 classes, all were canceled except for 2. Feedback from the law enforcement workforce told us that not having anyone available to answer phone calls, process registrations by phone, and invoice for course fees was an obstacle for agencies to participate.

The two classes that were successfully presented and were fully enrolled (Defensive Tactics Instructor and LGBT Law Enforcement Community Liaison).

For The Future

If the college wishes to continue providing certified workforce training for law enforcement, it must fund sufficient staff to be available during normal business hours to answer phone calls, process registrations, and invoice agencies for course fees. In addition, a coordinator must be funded to handle the required certification processes with the California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training, hire and assign qualified instructors, arrange for course materials and facilities, and oversee the delivery of courses.

The Department of Criminal Justice Education and Training has an interest in supporting the in-service workforce training needs of law enforcement. We have qualified staff will and interested in teaching, but we don't have the support staff to successfully schedule, market, and execute these classes. If the college wishes to serve the law enforcement workforce with in-service classes, a part time coordinator and administrative support will be required.

ADMINISTRATION OF JUSTICE FALL 2023

Completed by Supervising Administrator:

Jerry Dunlap

Date:

11.3.23

Strengths and successes of the program, as evidenced by analysis of data, outcomes assessment, and curriculum:

- High demand by the workforce for the Administration of Justice program.
- The success level for student job placement was excellent.
- The access to experienced and highly educated faculty was exceptional.
- There is a strong relationship with the local workforce through student internships and the advisory committee.
- Expansive array of stackable certificate options created a clear pathway to a degree, transfer, and transition into the workforce.

Areas of concern, if any:

- No major areas of concern.

Recommendations for improvement:

- Expand access for local high schools to CCAP classes being offered by the department.
- Increase enrollments to at least pre-pandemic levels.
- Boost the access for employers, recruiters, and student employment opportunities.

Additional information regarding resources:

- There is a need to maintain a dedicated space to facilitate access for students and recruiters. The most viable option would be to retain the former police academy classrooms and adjoining offices to meet these needs.
- The ADMJ-140 Introduction to Crime Scene Investigations course will need lab space, equipment, and storage space.
- There is a great desire and need to provide professional development for faculty on effective strategies for instructing online and the utilization of Canvas.